

Review of the CBA changes since the last published CBA version (4 December 2012):

- Impact on environment and society

Ivan Scrase
Senior Policy Officer The Royal
Society for the Protection of Birds

Martti van Blijswijk
Member of ENTSO-E Draft Team
Planning Standards (DT PS)

Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) methodology Workshop
24 June 2013, ENTSO-E premises, Brussels,

Contents

11:30 – 12:00:

- Introduction
- Process
- Changes (since previous consultation)
- Overview of current state
 - S.1 Environmental impact
 - S.2 Social impact
- Discussion

Introduction

Internal grid transfer capability increase	Cross border grid transfer capability increase	Contribution to 10% interconnection	Social and economic welfare (€)	Security of supply (MWh)	RES integration (MWh)	CO2 emissions variation (kt)	Losses variation (€)	Technical resilience (++)	Flexibility (++)	Costs (€)	Environmental impact
MW Generation and/or MW Demand	MW A to B and/or MW B to A	%									
											Km

- Global environmental effects: RES integration and CO₂ emissions variation
- Local social and environmental effects
 1. Mitigation measures
 - Eliminate or reduce the effect
 - Scope of indicator C.1 (project cost)
 2. Residual effects

Process

- Bilateral meetings between ENTSO-E and NGOs
- Discussions in the TYNDP stakeholder group
- Common drafts:
 - CBA Guidelines Annex 7 (*describing the methodology for assessing and providing information on (potential) residual environmental and social impact*)
 - Planning process document (*general document on the process of establishing the TYNDP, Regional Investment Plans and the articulation with National Development Plans and PCI selection process*)

Changes (since previous consultation)

- Separate social and environmental indicator
 - S.1 Environmental impact (natural environment)
 - S.2 Social impact (visual amenity and dense population)
- Definition of impact
 - # of km “in” sensitive area
- Removed colour codes
- Focus on scoring → Providing information

S.1 Environmental impact

- Project impact on **nature** and **biodiversity**
 - Residual effects
 - Uncertain effects
- Definition: # of km “in” sensitive area
 - Sensitive, because e.g.:
 - Habitats Directive
 - Birds Directive
 - RAMSAR site
 - IUCN key biodiversity areas
 - Other areas protected by national law
 - Range: decreasing bandwidth as project develops

S.1 Environmental impact



<i>Project</i>	<i>Stage</i>	<i>Impact</i> <i>Potentially crosses environmentally sensitive area (nb of km)</i>	<i>Typology of sensitivity</i>	<i>Link to further information</i>
A	Planned	Yes (a. 50 to 75 km; b. 30 to 40 km)	a. <u>Birds Directive</u> ; b. <u>Habitats Directive</u>	e.g. Big Hill SPA <u>www....</u>
B	Design & permitting	No		<u>www....</u>
C	Planned	Yes (20 km)	<u>Habitats Directive</u>	<u>www....</u>
D	Under consideration	N.A	N.A	<u>www....</u>

S.2 Social impact

- Project impact on **landscape** and **local population**
 - Residual effects
 - Uncertain effects
- Definition: # of km “in” sensitive area
 - Sensitive, because e.g.:
 - Crossing densely populated area
 - World heritage landscape
 - Other areas protected by national law
 - Range: decreasing bandwidth as project develops

S.2 Social impact



<i>Project</i>	<i>Stage</i>	<i>Impact: crosses dense area (nb of km)</i>	<i>Typology/intensity sensitivity of</i>	<i>Link to further information</i>
<i>A</i>	<i>Design & permitting</i>	<i>Yes (20 to 40km)</i>	<i>Dense area</i>	<i>www....</i>
<i>B</i>	<i>Planned</i>	<i>Yes (100 km)</i>	<i>European Landscape Convention</i>	<i>www....</i>
<i>C</i>	<i>Planned</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Submarine cable</i>	<i>www....</i>
<i>D</i>	<i>Under construction</i>	<i>Yes (50 km)</i>	<i>OHL</i>	<i>www....</i>

Questions & discussion

- What do you think about ...
 - indicator score: ‘# of km’ ?
 - increasing precision of values over time ?
 - definitions of “sensitive” areas ?
 - way of reporting ? (see example tables)
 - splitting the environmental impact and social impact indicators ?
 - focus on providing information vs. focus on assigning score ?

Thank you for your attention!